



# Exploring preconditions for effective global responses to climate change

Jeremy Webb University College London Department of Science, Technology, Engineering and Public Policy

23 April 2020, Motu Webinar

# Applied in Focus. Global in Reach.





## **Professional experience**

Environment Canterbury | Field technician Statistics New Zealand | Environmental-economic accounts United Nations Statistics Division | Environment statistics African Climate Policy Centre | Programme management African Centre for Statistics | Economic statistics African Minerals Development Centre | Geological information

## Academic training

University of Canterbury BSc, MSc | Geology Massey University PGDipDevStud | Development studies University College London, Doctoral Candidate | STEaPP

**Doctoral Candidate** | University College London | Department of Science, Technology, Engineering and Public Policy **Solar Subgroup Lead** | Expert Group on Resource Management | United Nations Economic Commission for Europe **Founder and Director** | Tiaki Institute

# Outline

### Climate change problem

### Data collection

## Data analysis

Scenarios

### Data processing

# Preconditions for effective global responses





Sources: IPCC 5<sup>th</sup> Assessment Report and Emissions Gap Report

Three years to safeguard our climate



UN Photo/Sarah Fretwell

## Three years to safeguard our climate

#### **Christiana Figueres**

Hans Joachim Schellnhuber Gail Whiteman Johan Rockström Anthony Hobley Stefan Rahmstorf Nature, 2017, Vol.546(7660), p.593

**UN Photo/Sarah Fretwell** 

#### **CARBON CRUNCH**

There is a mean budget of around 600 gigatonnes (Gt) of carbon dioxide left to emit before the planet warms dangerously, by more than 1.5-2°C. Stretching the budget to 800 Gt buys another 10 years, but at a greater risk of exceeding the temperature limit.





The Emissions Gap Report 2016 A UNEP Synthesis Report



As in the earlier Emissions Gap Reports, it is important to highlight that most scenarios that are available in the literature, and that limit warming to below 2 or 1.5°C, assume the use of so-called negative emissions technologies in the second half of the century -- that is the active and permanent removal of carbon dioxide from the atmosphere.



### WE HAVE THE SOLUTIONS TO PREVENT CATASTROPHIC CLIMATE CHANGE

 Paris Agreement
Business investment
Technology
Affordable renewable energy
Public support Who could implement these solutions?

Under what conditions?



#ClimateAction www.un.org/ sustainabledevelopment PHOTO: UN Photo/Rick Bajornas



Source: Surface and axes modified from Hardin Tibbs presentation Circa 2003

## **Research** questions



## Scenarios

Ramirez et al have shown that, when using appropriate methods, scenarios can "... produce 'interesting research' that is both usable and rigorous." (page 82, Ramirez et al 2015). The IPCC has assessed Integrated Assessment Models (IAMs), Representative Concentration Pathways (RCPs) and Shared Socio-economic Pathways (SSPs)

"The models use economics as the basis for decision making." (page 422, Clarke et al 2014)

What about security or other decision criteria driving the global response to climate change?

Decisions in these "...models tend toward the goal of minimizing the aggregate economic costs of achieving mitigation outcomes..." (page 422, Clarke et al 2014)

It is not clear whether incentive structures for actors, including oil and gas companies or so called "petro-states", would actually result in "minimizing aggregate costs"

"The models do not structurally represent many social and political forces that can influence the way the world evolves (e.g., shocks such as the oil crisis of the 1970s)." (page 422, Clarke et al 2014).

These shocks can drive systemic change and affect GHG emissions IPCC noted that "Omitting climate impacts and adaptation responses from scenarios is likely to lead to biased results for three main reasons." (page 442, Clarke et al 2014)

"...climate impacts could influence the effectiveness of mitigation options"

"...adaptation responses to climate change could themselves alter emissions from human activities, either increasing or decreasing the emissions reductions required to reach GHG-concentration goals."

"...mitigation strategies will need to compete with adaptation strategies for scarce investment and R&D resources, assuming these occur contemporaneously." (page 442, Clarke et al 2014)

The possibility of climate change impacts influencing ambition levels of actors and their responses does not appear to have been acknowledged as a possibility



Backcasting – reverse stress testing methods

Semistructured survey

- 1. Current climate change situation
- 2. Failure scenario
- 3. Success scenario

4. Other scenarios that affect climate or the global response to climate change

Success = fulfilling the UNFCCC objective



Source: United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change



Theory of change analysis (looking for if-then statements)



"multiverse" of possibilities

change and related issues

## **Plotting scenarios**

Theory of change analysis (looking for if-then statements)



Time

Issues



"...trying to understand how previous climate regimes influenced ecosystems and geomorphic systems and that is perhaps the most obvious manifestation of change is the changing of the coastlines..." (13008-13012) "...we already know that people that are wealthy and better educated, especially those people on the coast are very forceful in advocating for public money to be spent on coastal defences for example, like sea walls and installing pump stations and those sorts of things. Whereas people who are less educated and poorer are not very good advocates for themselves as far as that is concerned." (13030-13034) "...coastal areas being inundated and perhaps as we were talking before about, it would overwhelm the more drawn-out and complex societal policy responses" (13212)

ssues

fossil fuels. However, I

don't believe it'll come

some of the worst

12958)

soon enough to prevent



5330)

the scale of the problem seems to be substantial because it appears to be like using too much of kind of a runaway train in some ways, our emissions continually increasing and global efforts to reduce them. or even slow them, faltering and I guess not being as effective as need be according to what science tells for anyone who's thinking not just in the short term but in the 3104)

"So, where are we at? It seems in terms of the nature of the problem,

> "They [business and finance] could be putting money into infrastructure investments that help us address and reduce emissions or not. And that's an issue, particularly [for] subnational governments. Making sure we get that non-carbon infrastructure in place, so like, you know." (3162)

Low greenhouse gas emissions infrastructure investment needed

## Timing of investment is important

"If that's not done in the next decade now, that window's halfclosing. Then we're locked into higher emissions in current infrastructure that's for another 30, 50 years and it's, you know, some might argue that it's game over in some ways and viability to cut emissions." (3162-3164) Investment response before 2030

Investment response after 2030

Success

"Climate change is real. It's gonna be a significant problem by the end of the century according to the UN. We're probably talking about an impact that's equivalent to about 2 to 4% of GDP. So, it's the equivalent of each person, on average, on the planet being 2 to 4% less well-off by the end of the century." (1547)

senes

"...the political solution is to dramatically increase spending on research... then UNFCCC should focus a lot more on getting nations to get to spend money on research and development. It's much cheaper, it's much easier, it's also much easier to validate 'cause you can do it. You know, you can, say, just at the end of this year, you can actually see in the budget for the nex year how much money you're gonna spend." (1641-1645)

oact	Budget information	"What we need is the long	With regards to the UNFCCC and GHG emissions,
n 2 Lof	"And so, the main part politicians have to do is to dramatically increase their investment in research and development. If we do that,	work out over the next couple of decades. So that's much more about having overnment Need to focus on long	rid of all of it whereas the reality is we'll get rid of most of it if we're good." (1591-1593) "And also accept that you're not going to be able to fix all global warming, just like any of the policy probably will only fix The solution is not
But,	chance. If we don't, we have a much lower chance. (1615)	"Busiterm, researchint you to close to market, they would already and development money on compa	p invest in sperfection, tout partial twas be investing in it If we spend lots of the research anies, we're gonna get close to market technology
nd bal	Governments should increase research spend the problem, it il make it a little, like,	dingex that actually reflects what the more likely to happen." (1609-1611)	void close to market research funding

"...fundamentally, the only way I can imagine that we're gonna achieve some sort of stabilization on a fairly low temperature is if we manage to get technologies that are cheap and produce about the same benefits as fossil fuels do now." (1575) "The fundamental point here is much more about getting green energy to be so cheap that it's close to taking over." (1603) "...we need technology in order to solve this if you're gonna, if it's both gonna be politically realistic and if it's gonna be realistic economically to stabilize at a low level." (1597) "But if we can make technology that's gonna be cheaper... that are green then we can get this takeover. If we don't, it won't happen." (1579-1581)

"Now, of course, the argument in some ways is that a carbon tax could be the alternative to that. So, you know, carbon tax globally implemented could actually achieve the same thing by making fossil fuel so expensive that any eventually, all kinds of green energy would be cheaper than fossil fuels and some people would switch over. But, of course, that would very easily run into the problem with actually being more expensive than the original problem that it was intended to solve which is why, you know, some standard economic models showed that you should do some things, that you should have modern carbon tax growing over the century but it will only fix a smaller part of the problem..." (1581-1583)

#### Time

UNFCCC

"We are getting to the time when the future becomes the present, and even the past. Climate change started as an issue that was about atmospheric chemistry and about impacts in the future, and then it began to be about we think that maybe it's going to begin to show up in some present. And now, it's pretty much irrefutable, then we have too many of the things that are happening are manifestation of a changed climate. And also, they are manifesting that, for those who are already on the edge of survival, this means catastrophic change. And for people who are pretty well off, like the middle in California, suddenly things are happening that are beyond the ability to cope, so it's bad. Extreme events combined with societal [impacts]. So, extreme weather events, temperature, wind, rainfall anomalies, both in terms of shocks and in terms of trends that [unintelligible] on accumulating tipping point... you know, it's the little, all the things that we knew from science are beginning to show 13289)

## Youth taking their own path

"The generation of our children is going to not give a damn what is expected of them, and is going to want to take what they want by taking it. And there's going to be two extreme caricatures of what may await." (13604)



#### Selfishness

"What we are seeing know in certain, you know, parts of Europe and North America with youth storming in and saying, "You know what? I have a right to this. I'm gonna show up. I'm beginning to do this successful." Fingers crossed." (13612)

...scientists have made it clear. and the meteorologists are, now some of them are starting to be able to feel confident enough to say that this particular hurricane hitting USA or Philippines, or Japan, is result of climate change in so far as the frequency more than a few organizations that are already assessing the damage to the economy. Like in terms of individual extreme weather events. one-off extreme weather events, so many billion dollars or whatever..." (1790 - 1796)

"Catastrophic is the term used as you know, as well. And we've got, you gathering wisdom is we've got about 10 years left to turn that around." (1780 - 1782)

#### Globalism versus nationalism

...you've got to, gotta step back from climate and sustainability issues for the moment and see what's happening in the world politically and you've got massive movements going on. One is more of an intellectual realization that we have to cohere together as a species and however we structure ourselves politically for decision making. So, I just call that the globalist approach. And then you've got the nationalist-populist backlash against the migratory flows especially, and so you have it in the United States and in Venezuela and quite possibly Brazil, ...you do have spots of populist backlash and for that matter inside Europe and the UK. So, it begs the question as to how those competing, and they are conflicting forces, play out to make decision making on anything whether it's military but also on sustainability and climate..." (2183-2187)

under stress, is another. You know, it's a defining r

some stage and there's international level and on the question is do they kick in somehow the Council whatever. suddenly start baying and

"Does that occur before 2030 or after 2030? By definition if it is after 2030 it is too late..." (2197)

#### Concerted response on time



Concerted response too late

Emergency powers but whethe r you politically succeed, even "Now we've got a global commons problem that makes it i United Nations Security Council 240-2242) "So, yeah, because you know the UN negotiated machinery would've become, the political and milit(ary), and social instability would've become so fraught that your ability to negotiate a coherent single proactive response is minimized." (2246) "Maybe I'm just optimistic enough to think that the multilevel machinery will never collapse. But it doesn't follow from that, that it will, that the circumstances will allow that continuing multilevel machinery that will be under severe stress, to find that, create a problem

unless you get some kind of emergency agreement with enforcement of the global element." (2236)

"Well, as I understand it's, changes have already taken place that cannot be reversed and we're on track for, at the moment for, 2.7 degrees which is disastrous. So, I see it in just in terms of, where we're at is, beyond urgent really." (9699) "Severe weather events. the also, the rise in sea levels the, as I said the impact on the food production we see. So, the impact on agriculture and the interests that people might have or have not in pursuing that as a career you know." (9922-9928)

#### "it would [affect] markets, it would affect politics…" (10396)

Global pandemic (i.e. bug causing population decline)

Pandemic

## International cooperation shown to be useful

"...demonstrate the value of global cooperation..." (10402)

"It may it may enhance global cooperation to deal with it. You know, it might bolster the strength of the UN to, you know, the WHO, you know, UN too." (10398-10402)

Strengthens faith in international cooperation





All scenarios and scenario elements were accepted as being "possible futures"



176 scenarios

The "searchable sample of possible futures" consisted of 7 branching scenarios, 50 failure scenarios, 67 success scenarios and 52 other scenarios

Instead of restricting the study to four or five reference scenarios The analysis focused on conditions found in success scenarios

The study mapped multiple possible pathways between scenario elements and themes

Common conditions in success scenarios are preconditions for effective responses







Possible preconditions

Possible responses















"Some impacts on human systems have also been attributed to climate change, with a major or minor contribution of climate change distinguishable from other influences." (Page 6, IPCC 2014).

A climate stress signal has only just emerged

> But is likely to get stronger soon

"Unambiguous detection of climate-induced changes in most ecological and social systems will prove extremely difficult in the coming decades." (Page 6, IPCC 1995).

5 Degrees

4 Degrees

Risk of impacts on human and managed systems moderate to very high at 2°C of global warming (IPCC 2018)

Growth Stress Time

Risk of impacts on human and managed systems undetectable to moderate at ~1°C of global warming (IPCC 2018)

Risk of impacts on human and managed systems moderate to high at 1.5°C of global warming (IPCC 2018)

Source: Surface and axes modified from Hardin Tibbs presentation Circa 2003

Ambition	Trigger/driver (strategy)	Justification and framing	Actions	
Negative	<b>Cynical response</b> (non-cooperation)	<b>Special interests</b> : the extent to which special interests benefit	Deliberate negative contributions, "burn baby burn"	
Nege	Non-response	<b>None</b> : Denial*, apathy or hopelessness leading to inaction or incidental helpful	Incidental negative contributions to the global response, "ignorance is bliss"*	
None	(free riding and no cost contributions)	contributions to the global response to climate change.	Incidental positive contributions to the global response	
Low to high	<b>Cost benefit</b> <b>response</b> (competition and cooperation)	<b>Cost benefit analysis</b> : Decisions to act on climate change are based on costs and benefits of the options being considered	"Act at costs up to social cost of carbon"*	
High to very high	Enlightened response (cooperation)	<b>Evidence</b> of impacts, risks and need to limit climate change and its impacts	Collective action on adaptation and mitigation	
.,	Security response	Security: Climate change is a clear and present danger. It has been decided that	"Containment and defence"*	
very high	(cooperation and coercion)	climate change needs to be acted upon and now it is a question of what can be achieved with the resources available	Containment and fix	

Source: Author except when marked \* which indicates the source as Grubb 2014



## Contributions to the global response

	Response					
Signals	Trigger or driver	Attitude	Contribution to global response			
	Enlightenment or emergency	Cooperative, competitive or technological	More likely to be positive			
Climate stress, response risks and	Cost benefit Cooperative, competitive o technological		Likely to be negative overall			
opportunities	Cost benefit or emergency	Defensive	Likely to be very			
Response risks and opportunities only	negative No trigger e.g. non-response or cynical					

Source: Jeremy Webb

Power and are imp	capacity ortant	Effectiveness of global response			
		Pos	Effectiveness		
Signals	coalitions	Trigger or driver	Attitude	Contribution	of global response
	With power and capacity	Enlightenment or emergency	Cooperative, competitive or technological	More likely to be positive	More likely to be effective
		Cost benefit	Cooperative, competitive or technological	Likely to be negative overall	Unlikely to be effective
response risks		Cost benefit or emergency	Defensive	Likely to be	Very unlikely
and opportunities		No trigger e.g. non-re	esponse or cynical		to be effective
	With limited power and capacity	Cost benefit, enlightenment or	Cooperative,		Limited
			competitive,	Positive or	influence on
			technological or	negative	effectiveness.
		emergency	defensive	contributions	Unlikely to be
		No trigger e.g. non-re	esponse or cynical		effective
				Source	e: Jeremy Webb





CO <sub>2</sub> -eq Concentrations in 2100 (ppm CO <sub>2</sub> -eq) Category label (conc.	Subcategories	Relative position of the RCPs	Change emissions to 201	in CO <sub>2</sub> -eq compared 0 (in %)	Likelihood of staying below a specific temperature levelow over the 21 <sup>st</sup> century (relative to 1850-1900)			erature level 1900)
range)			2050	2100	<1.5°C	<2°C	<3°C	<4°C
<430	Only	a limited number	of individual	model studie	es have exploi	red level below 43	30 ppm CO2-eq	
450 (430 to 480)	Total range	RCP2.6	-72 to -41	-118 to -78	More unlikely than likely	Likely	Likely	Likely
500 (480-5300)	No overshoot of 530 ppm CO2-eq		-57 to - 42	-107 to -73	Unlikely	More likely than not		
	Overshoot of 530		-55 to -25	-114 to -90		About as likely		
Its	conceiv	>	as not					
550			il gior	<b>9</b> <sup>1</sup> to -59		More unlikely		
<sup>(530 to 5</sup> <sup>80)</sup> Wa	rmina mi	aht be l		than likely				
	580-ppm COzed	/lata		-165 10 -60				
(580 to 650)	expected	(but un	likely	-134 to -50				
(650 to 72	Total range		-11 to 17	-54 to -21		Unlikely	More likely	
						,	than not	
(720 to 1000)	Total range	RCP6.0	18 to 54	-7 to 72	Unlikely		More unlikely than likely	
>1000	Total range	RCP8.5	52 to 95	74 to 178		Unlikely	Unlikely	More unlikely than likely

Source: IPCC 2014

## Effective response scenarios

Signals	Types of global responses Trigger or driver Attitude		Serendipity		
Climate science, risks and impacts	Leadership response		<b>Creating the preconditions for serendipity</b> Leadership influencing social change and behaviour, policy, business, technologies, practices, and coalitions, can help generate social permissions, negotiate social contracts and create response options needed for effective global responses		
Climate stress.	Enlightenment or emergency	Cooperative, competitive or technological	High levels of serendipity needed, including: Climate sensitivity is no higher than anticipated Climate change and related impacts can be halted GHG removals can be done at scale if needed Other unexpected changes don't hinder the global response to climate change		
response risks and opportunities	Cost benefit	Cooperative, competitive or technological	Very high levels of serendipity needed, including: Climate sensitivity is lower than anticipated Climate change and related impacts are reversible Climate resilient low emissions technologies and practices become cheap quicker than expected GHG removals technologies and practices are available and done at scale Other unexpected changes help the global response to climate change		
	Cost benefit or emergency	Defensive	Incredible levels of serendipity needed, including: Climate sensitivity is much lower than anticipated		
Response risks	Blind luck non-response		Climate change and related impacts are reversible Climate resilient low emissions technologies and practices become very cheap very quickly		
and opportunities	Failed cynical response		GHG removals technologies and practices are available and are eventually done at scale Other unexpected changes help the global response to climate change		

Source: Jeremy Webb

# Preconditions for effective global responses to climate change



related

Other changes limit climate change or help the global response

# Condition under which actors might act on effective response options



# Summary

From the sample of possible futures, only impacts and risks to human and managed systems (e.g. agriculture) were capable of driving effective global responses to climate change

The climate stress signal, in the form of impacts to human and managed systems, has only recently emerged

This represents a fundamental shift in the response system

How this will influence the global response is unclear

Serendipity is an important part of an effective global response to climate change

Leadership can create the conditions for serendipity

Creating options for the global response

The global response depends on the extent to which climate change is a problem that needs to be solved versus a condition that society lives with

It also depends upon how the climate change problem is defined

# Questions

Who are the main actors in New Zealand?

What signals are these actors getting?

Which scenarios are we considering?

To what extent are we relying on serendipity?



Applied in Focus. Global in Reach.

## Thank you

## Jeremy Webb

## jeremy.webb.15@ucl.ac.uk

https://www.linkedin.com/in/jeremy-webb-international/